

**EUROPEAN
EXPERT
NETWORK
ON CULTURE
(EENC)**

***The Role of Arts Education
in Enhancing School Attractiveness:
a literature review***

by Anne Bamford and Michael Wimmer

EENC Paper, February 2012

This document has been prepared by Anne Bamford and Michael Wimmer on behalf of the European Expert Network on Culture (EENC). Assistance has been provided by Jordi Baltà (Interarts).

The EENC was set up in 2010 at the initiative of Directorate-General for Education and Culture of the European Commission (DG EAC), with the aim of contributing to the improvement of policy development in Europe. It provides advice and support to DG EAC in the analysis of cultural policies and their implications at national, regional and European levels. The EENC involves 17 independent experts and is coordinated by Interarts and Culture Action Europe. For additional information see www.eenc.eu.

Following comments submitted by DG EAC, a revised version of the paper is presented in March 2012.

Contents

Introduction	4
A historic continuity	4
Current influences	5
School has become a complex system	7
Expectations of attractiveness of the different school stakeholders	9
Attractiveness for students	11
Attractiveness for parents	13
Attractiveness for teachers	14
Attractiveness for school boards and administrators	15
Attractiveness for the community, economy and labour markets	17
How might the arts contribute to school attractiveness?	18
Under which circumstances arts in school may generate such impact?	19
Conclusions and recommendations	21
References	23
Appendix	29

Introduction

This paper summarises the main literature that presents research-based evidence of the impact of the arts on school attractiveness and students' engagement with school. In addition to the research studies that **directly** examine arts impact on students' engagement, studies have also been included where it could be reasonably argued that **a correlation could exist** between relevant educational finding in terms of school attractiveness, and where there is also evidence that the arts, culture and or creative teaching and learning may lead directly or indirectly to those given educational outcomes.

The paper emerges from a request presented by the Culture Policy, Diversity and Intercultural Dialogue Unit at DG EAC, in the context of the EU Council of Minister's adoption of 'Conclusions on Cultural and Creative Competences' in November 2011 and with a view to forthcoming activities in the framework of the Council's Work Plan for Culture 2011-14.

Relevant research has been included, both in the general body of the paper and as a detailed appendix containing summaries of pertinent research including a short description of each piece of research and its main conclusions. Whilst the focus has been on literature within the EU, relevant documents from elsewhere in the world have been included where their results have bearing on the European school context.

A historic continuity

The exceptional role of the arts in education, and arguably in increasing school attractiveness, has been a proposition since the beginning of public schooling. In this respect the "Aesthetic Letters" of Friedrich Schiller from 1793 have been of particular significance and continue to feed the pedagogical discussion up to today.

It was the Hamburg museum director Alfred Lichtwark who, at the beginning of the 1900s, organised three arts education congresses which prepared the ground for the discussions on the contribution of the arts in school development that have continued throughout the 20th century (**Kunsterzieherkongresse 1900, 1902, 1904**).

This early work contributed to the reform pedagogy movement which put particular emphasis on making the arts a core component of schooling (**Stöger: *Kunst in der Schule*, 2001**) and enabled a tradition of good practices starting with the Eugenie-Schwarzwald-Schule in Vienna (**Streibel: *Eugenie Schwarzwald und ihr Kreis*, 1996**) with a particular attention to issues of gender, the Waldorf-Schulen at different locations leading up to Helene-Lange-Schule (**Becker: *Das andere Lernen*, 1997**)

Current influences

In most European schools some aspects of “the arts” have been established within the core curriculum of most schools. (**Eurydice: *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe, 2009***). While the degree to which the arts are included in national curriculum varies, it could be argued that most policies for the state school - as an institution - encourage young people to take part in the social, economic AND cultural life.

While this may exist in policy, there is anxiety that practices may fall short of this aspiration. There are ongoing concerns - arguably mainly from the arts education sector - that the arts still play a rather peripheral role in school. Visual Arts and Music are most likely to be included in the school curriculum, while drama, dance, media arts and architecture are rarely if ever taught in their own right. Some aspects of the arts such as theatre and dance are not part of the core curriculum.¹ Arguably, there is even less focus on radio, TV or digital media which are rarely included as part of the regular curriculum at all². Instead of making the arts a core issue of school provision throughout the last years a number of supplementary, ‘out-of-school’ programmes and projects have been developed with the hope of compensating for supposed existing structural deficits (“Creative Partnerships” in England, “Cultural Rucksack” in Norway, “Kultur-Agenten” in Germany or “p[Art]s” in Austria³).

The amount of literature on the profound changes of national societies and their consequences for the school systems is perhaps as equally enormous as it is confusing (**Robinson: *All Our Futures, 1999***)

Since the early 1990s, there has been a steady move to more market-like environments for schools and more devolution of decision-making to the school board level. Since this time, market theories and giving choices to users of services have become powerful influences of educational policy. It is argued that providing more choice is likely to lead to greater quality and efficiency in services. While it could be suggested that this push to greater consideration of market forces in educational decision making is a politically ‘right’ agenda, forces of the left of politics within Europe have equally championed the need for schools to provide ‘diverse models’, to have their ‘distinctive character’ and for parents and teachers to be able to choose their ‘desired’ model of education. To inform this choice making, schools are

¹ Eurydice (2009): *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe*, Brussels: EACEA.
http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/education/eurydice/documents/thematic_reports/113EN.pdf

² Robinson: ‘Ken Robinson says schools kill creativity’ (2006)
http://www.ted.com/talks/ken_robinson_says_schools_kill_creativity.html

³ Creative Partnerships was a programme aimed at implementing longer term school change through the involvement of artists in planning and development within the school. Typically, the artists would be linked for between 1-3 years in the school. This programme aimed at whole school change rather than children just meeting cultural experiences. By contrast, the Cultural Rucksack in Norway and the other programmes mentioned aimed at exposing children to professional artists and were generally ‘short term’ projects. While arguably Creative Partnerships led to long term changes in school attractiveness, the other programmes, may boost children’s interest in school over a short time frame, but are unlikely to lead to long term changes in the appeal of a school.

more actively developing a media profile and marketing strategy. This means that more information about the school's achievement and curriculum are in the public domain and schools produce seductive brochures, prospectus, websites, 'open days' and so on to attract potential students. **(Philip A. Woods, Carl Bagley, Ron Glatter (1998): *School choice and competition: markets in the public interest*. London: Routledge).**

Arguably, as achievement league tables are published in national newspapers and parents and pupils have a greater choice of schools, schools have become more competitive places. The focus is on preparing students for universal competitiveness, while concurrently it seems to be increasingly difficult for schools to develop something like a "common meaning" relevant for all students which goes beyond the accentuation of personal assertiveness. **(Gerver: *Creating tomorrow's schools today*, 2010).** There is a large volume of advocacy driven literature that suggests that the arts can play a role in fulfilling both tasks - empowering individual strengths AND producing the "common meaning" as a necessary prerequisite for the realisation of individuality which otherwise leads to separation and disoriented desperation. **(Groves; Baumber: *Regenerating schools*, 2008).**

In the transition of material to immaterial production there is a lot of evidence that the arts can contribute to economic growth and prosperity. In this context the Council of the European Union has passed a number of recommendations and conclusions which emphasise the importance of the acquisition of cultural and creative competences in and out of school to meet the requirements of the creative and cultural industries **(Assessment results of "*Creative Partnerships*" in England)**. In this context the importance of the arts as regards the key competence "cultural awareness and expression" is stressed in the Recommendations of *Lifelong Learning 2006* when referring to the "appreciation of the importance of the creative expression of ideas, experiences and emotions in the range of media, including music, performing arts, literature, and the visual arts" and in the *2011 Council Conclusions on Cultural and Creative Competences*⁴.

The perceived economic benefit of the arts has led to a considerable repositioning of the arts in education and more broadly in society. The arts influence European societies in all aspects of the living and working circumstances of their citizens. This has led to an aesthetic penetration of products as well as in communication. To understand these aesthetic languages and codes has become an increasingly important part of a school's mission. For example, does a more aesthetic notion of education a better space to learn, to understand, to influence and to make use of aesthetic codes, as we see in "critical media education" as a priority in visual arts education. For young people aesthetic has become a key issue of their everyday life. Not to take that into account makes schools not just unattractive but irrelevant.

⁴ Council of the European Union, 'Council Conclusions on cultural and creative competences and their role in building intellectual capital of Europe', 28-29 November 2011.
http://www.consilium.europa.eu/uedocs/cms_Data/docs/pressdata/en/educ/126401.pdf

School has become a complex system

National education policies throughout the last years all over Europe have led to a considerable diversity of schools with different priorities, profiles and target groups. Accordingly this diversity represents an incalculable variety of ways how to deal (and not to deal) with the arts in school. **(Braun; Fuchs; Kelb: *Auf dem Weg zur Kulturschule, 2010*)**. Nevertheless there are a number of commonalities which characterize contemporary schooling, including:

- **Individualization**: Not for every student does the same thing at the same time and it is important to stimulate individual strengths.
- **Autonomy and output orientation**: Reorientation of education policy from the input to the output side and thereby giving schools more autonomy in which way and with which means they may reach common output expectations (e.g. common and comparable assessment strategies such as PISA).
- **Competency acquisitions**: Moving from knowledge mediation to the acquisition of competences.
- **Reinforcing cultural identity**: There are specific cultural policy expectations towards schools to contribute to the reassurance of national cultural identities (a “Canon”) as a reaction against the perceived pressure of globalization on national identity on times of globalization (e.g. France, Netherlands, Denmark, Belgium, Norway)

While these common ‘drivers’ exist within the variety of school types, there are quite different ways that schools see the arts as contributing to school attractiveness.

In primary schools, the arts are often used in a playful way. There are often no strict time limits in terms of lesson plans **(Holt: *Primary arts education, 1997*)**. In recent years, an increasing number of primary schools have developed “arts” specific profiles (e.g. “Musikvolksschule”) to be more attractive for pupils and their parents **(Medňanská: *Die Grund-Kunstschule im slowakischen Schulwesen, 2007*)** or have adopted particular creative or arts-based philosophies to give them an edge in attracting often middle class parents (e.g. Steiner and Montessori). In the United Kingdom, “Arts Mark”⁵ awards were keenly sought by schools to indicate that a school had a strong arts profile. Throughout Europe there are schools with priorities in the arts (“Musikhauptschule”), ‘Magnet’ schools (in the US but also in the Netherlands) and schools in close cooperation with cultural institutions. **(Durando: *Analyse des dispositifs et initiatives liant la culture et l’éducation, 2006*)**

In Sweden, where arguably there is the most ‘free market’ approach to education and therefore pupil and parent choice of schools, a number of schools have a strong arts profile.

⁵ <http://www.artsmark.org.uk/>

At the compulsory school level, there are several schools with a defined music-, dance- or art profile. Despite this, the Ministry of Education and Research in Sweden has no comprehensive national list of these schools and to what extent arts subjects are a part of the schedule. (Eurydice: 'Sweden', in *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe, 2007/08*)

Arguably, the focus on the arts diminishes as the child moves from primary to secondary school⁶. They are relegated to the margins of the school curriculum and certain art forms are not taught at all. Nevertheless in secondary schools you can find an increasing number of schools with an arts specific profile with the intention to attract new pupils. These are often popular schools for young people and academic orientated schools are more likely to provide diverse arts offerings than those schools with a vocational focus. (National Center for Educational Statistics: *Extracurricular Participation and Student Engagement, June 1995 (NCES 95-741)*)

Vocational schools provide preparatory training for the labour market. Mainly in schools with natural science, technology and all kinds of crafts the ordinary curriculum does not comprise "the arts" at all. Nevertheless at least some aspects of design become indispensable in each subject to follow the trend of comprehensive aesthetics of products and services. And also the aspect of "interculturality" has become a major trans-curricular issue because of the current demographic changes (EDUCULT: *Kulturelle Bildung und berufsbildende Schulen, 2010*). Other schools dedicated to professions in the field of social welfare include "the arts" and by that increase the gender gap of arts provision. Up to now the particular needs of the creative and cultural industries seem insufficiently represented in the curricula of the vocational schools; respective competences have to be acquired by "training on the job".

Additionally, schools may organize cross-curricular cultural projects which are often stimulated by cultural policy programmes from outside the school. Particularly in middle European countries, which up until now have had half-day schooling, there has been a recent trend towards whole-day schooling, leading to new ways of cooperation between schools and cultural institutions. Extra-curricular activities are defined as activities designed for young people of school age to participate in learning activities outside of normal curriculum time. Some education systems or schools offer publicly-funded or publicly-subsidised arts activities outside school hours – during lunch breaks, after school, at weekends or in school holidays. Almost all European countries encourage schools to offer extra-curricular activities in the arts. These activities may be provided by schools and/or other organisations, such as artists, museums and other cultural institutions.

⁶ In terms of time devoted to the arts, approximately half the European countries dedicate between 50 and 100 hours per year to the arts at primary level and between 25 and 75 hours per year at lower secondary level. Cf. Eurydice (2009).

Expectations of attractiveness of the different school stakeholders

When talking about attractiveness it has to be found out for whom the school is attractive. There are different aspects of attractiveness depending on the views of the main school stakeholders, namely students, parents, teachers, school boards and community. **(Becker: Abschlussbericht zum Evaluationsvorhaben im Rahmen des Projekts "Kultur macht Schule" der Bundesvereinigung Kulturelle Kinder- und Jugendbildung e.V., 2007).**

There are two main ways we can examine the connection between art and school attractiveness. In the first instance, there is the role of the arts attractiveness for *schooling* in general (e.g. do the arts have a role to play in making school systems more relevant to today's needs?). Secondly, do the arts increase the attractiveness of specific *schools* (e.g. 'should I send my child to this school or that school?'). These two approaches can be easily reconciled as generally the criteria for choosing a certain school (by well-informed parents or carers) generally set the standard of desirability for schools in general. But, as the following section outlines, while a school may be deemed to be attractive to one stakeholder, this may not be treated as being attractive by another stakeholder, so 'attractiveness' becomes not only a factor of context, but also through whose eyes the context is viewed.

Attractiveness of the school can be measured in a number of ways. Some would argue that the best measure of school attractiveness may be the level of well-being and motivation of pupils. Others might argue that a (small) turnover of teachers or greater staff and student retention rates may be a more accurate measure of attractiveness. As the opportunity for school choice increases in most European countries, a more 'free market' approach to school attractiveness may exist whereby the way the school is perceived in the neighborhood and the requests for enrolment may be the best judge of overall attractiveness.

In summary, parents and children tended to choose schools with:

1. A school curriculum beyond national examinations and qualifications
 - a. Developing a child's self-construct
 - b. Developing a child's creativity
2. A school environment that would meet their child's social needs
 - a. Developing social skills
 - b. Developing communication skills
3. A school environment that would meet their child's emotional needs
 - a. Happiness of the child/ A happy school experience
 - b. Disciplined, good/ well-behaved children
4. A school environment that would meet their child's educational needs
 - a. Academic results/Emphasis on good exam results.
 - b. Intellectual development

If we take each of these four characteristics in order, there is a body of evidence that supports the theory that the arts contribute positively to the choices made, at least the choices of parents and children.

1. *A school curriculum beyond national examinations and qualifications*

- **Catterall (2007)** concluded that children who participated in 'School Project' (a school-based extra-curricular multi-component drama initiative) had, on average, higher self-construct scores than those who did not. (SEE APPENDIX 1)
- **Catterall and Pepler (2007)** concluded that children who participated in a school-based multi-component visual arts initiative had, on average, higher self-construct scores than those who did not. (SEE APPENDIX 2)
- **Catterall and Pepler (2007)** found that children who participated in a multi-component visual arts instruction aimed at inner city children in two major US cities, made greater progress in developing creativity than children who did not. (SEE APPENDIX 2)
- **Hui and Lau (2006)** found that children who participated in an extra-curricular multi-component creative drama project, made greater progress in developing creativity than children who did not (SEE APPENDIX 3)

2. *A school environment that would meet their child's social needs*

- **Kim et al. (2008)** found that children who participated in music activities (improvisational music therapy) made greater improvements in communication skills than the group that did not participate in such activities. (SEE APPENDIX 4)
- **Bigelow (1997)** found that children who participated in a school-based performing arts course (involving instrumental and vocal music, drama and dance) made greater improvements in communication skills than the group that did not participate in such activities (SEE APPENDIX 5)
- **Freeman (2001)** found that children who participated in a school-based multi-component creative drama activity made greater improvements in social skills than the group that did not participate in such activities (SEE APPENDIX 6)
- **Catterall (2007)** found that children who participated in an extra-curricular multi-component drama initiative called the 'School Project', made greater improvements in social skills than the group that did not participate in such activities. (SEE APPENDIX 1)

3. *A school environment that would meet their child's emotional needs*

- **Merrell (2005)** found that when children participated in arts activities, there were positive improvements to attitudes about bullying in schools. (SEE APPENDIX 7)
- **Merrell (2005)** found that when children participated in arts activities, there was an increase in positive direct intervention in bullying situations. (SEE APPENDIX 7)

- **Krahe and Knappert (2009)** found that children who participated in a theatre-based arts project had better performance in self-protective skills (distinguishing good/bad touch, secrets, getting help, and rejecting unwanted touch) than the control group who did not participate (SEE APPENDIX 8)

4. A school environment that would meet their child's educational needs

- **Costa-Giomi (2004)** found that primary school students who had three years of weekly individual piano instruction had better language and mathematics skills than the comparison group of students who did not get this instruction. (SEE APPENDIX 9)
- **Fleming et al. (2004)** found that primary school students who participated in the National Theatre's three-year drama project performed better at numeracy and reading than a comparable group of students who did not participate. (SEE APPENDIX 10)
- **Kendall et al. (2008)** found that Key Stage 3 & 4 students who took part in the Creative Partnerships Scheme gained better results in their Mathematics, English and Science exams. (SEE APPENDIX 11)
- **Von Rossberg-Gempton et al. (1999)** found that young people who participated in creative dance programmes made greater improvements in cognitive performance than the group that did not participate in such activities (SEE APPENDIX 12)
- **Bilhartz et al. (1999)** found that young people who participated in singing, playing instruments and movement activities made greater improvements in cognitive performance than the group that did not participate in such activities (SEE APPENDIX 13)
- **Cooper et al. (2011)** found that young people who had taken part in Creative Partnerships made greater progress in speaking and listening than similar pupils who had not participated. (SEE APPENDIX 15)

If we are to assume that the current trend is for schools to adopt more market-driven approaches to schooling, then to understand school attractiveness in detail, we need to consider a more sophisticated and behavioural/psychometric segmentation of the types of users or stakeholders within the educational system. To that end, the following sections treat each potential stakeholder in education as being subject to a number of 'drivers' that determine the decisions they may make in relation to their perceptions of school attractiveness.

Attractiveness for students

There are a number of factors that seem to positively influence students' perceptions of school attractiveness. These include:

- When they are able to bring into the school their individual and cultural backgrounds.
- When they feel taken serious, motivated and stimulated.

- When their learning content is related to their everyday life and manageable with their preferred instruments (technology) and learning styles.
- When their cultural learning is research driven.
- When self-awareness, empowerment and experience of individuality is boosted by their engagement in the arts.
- When their gender roles are articulated and discussed culturally.

(Kulturprojekte Berlin GmbH (Ed.): *Jugendliche befragen Jugendliche*, 2010)

(Cultural Learning Alliance (CLA): *ImagineNation - The Case for Cultural Learning*, 2011)

(Geier: *Schlüsselkompetenzen durch kulturelle Bildung*, 2006)

**(Czibobly (Ed.): *DICE – Drama Improves Lisbon Key Competences in Education*, 2010
SEE APPENDIX 32)**

Based on students' reports of their school experiences, the following factors all predicted better social behavioural outcomes and progress from age 11 to age 14:

- the 'quality of teaching' – including factors such as a strong 'emphasis on learning' by teachers,
'teacher support' for learning and a feeling that teachers 'valued students';
- the 'behaviour climate' of the school;
- the 'headteacher qualities';
- the physical 'school environment';
- the 'school resources'

From this list, it could be argued that education using more creative or artistic methods would improve the quality of teaching. More opportunity for positive social interaction (as is often the case in arts classes) could improve the behaviour quality, while attractively displayed and respected arts and cultural objects could enhance the school environment. There is no connection apparent in the literature around school leadership and the arts nor about resource levels and the arts so further studies would need to be undertaken to determine if there was any possible link in relation to these areas. The report concluded that efforts to improving students' academic self-concept, as well as their 'enjoyment of school', are likely to promote better social-behavioural outcomes, while improvements in social-behaviour are likely to benefit academic outcomes and self-concept. **(Pam Sammons, Kathy Sylva, Edward Melhuish, Iram Siraj-Blatchford, Brenda Taggart, Diana Draghici, Rebecca Smees and Katalin Toth, *Effective Pre-school, Primary and Secondary Education Project (EPPSE 3-14) Influences on students' development in Key Stage 3: Social-behavioural outcomes in Year 9*. Department for Education, UK, 2012)**

Attractiveness for parents

There are a number of factors that seem to positively influence students' perceptions of school attractiveness. These include:

- When they experience the well-being of their children
- When they know their children in an environment where they are accepted as they are
- When arts and culture in school helps their children finding a meaning of their life
- When arts and culture in school helps increasing the chances to find an appropriate job
- When cultural projects allow new qualities of encounters between parents and schools.

Reinhard Kahl as a prominent journalist in Germany developed new – and effective in all directions – formats to make visible the positive effects of arts education in schools. Whether in personal presentations, videos or books, he reaches large numbers of parents who learn to understand the importance of arts education for the development of the personalities of the learner (**Kahl: *Individualisierung: Das Geheimnis guter Schulen*, 2011**). Other literature is dedicated to making transparent the mediation of competences through arts education for potential employers and parents, who get evidence that children do learn something in dealing with the arts which is relevant for the further personal *and* professional career. (**Timmerberg, Vera; and Schorn, Brigitte (Ed.): *Neue Wege der Anerkennung von Kompetenzen in der Kulturellen Bildung*, 2009**)

Parents commonly shared a set of priorities which influenced their choice of school: an education wholly or largely in English, the opportunity for their children to meet and interact with people of other cultures, a curriculum that looked beyond the national, examinations and qualifications with international currency, and a school environment that would meet their child's social, emotional and educational needs. (**MacKenzie, P., 'School choice in an international context', *Journal of Research in International Education*, 9 (2), 2010, pp. 107-123.**)

Boulton and Coldron conducted a meta-analysis of results of a number of projects that investigated the criteria parents used when choosing schools. In those studies it was found that the happiness of the child was a crucial consideration and that academic criteria were significantly minimized. One of the projects, that was conducted at Sheffield, set out to try to clarify what parents might mean by the vague criterion of 'happiness'. The results of this investigation show a complex set of reasons cited by parents for their decisions. A possible explanation for the relative importance of the criteria is proposed. The conclusion is drawn that schools and those concerned with the presentation of their practice to parents should

not be exclusively preoccupied with the single criterion of academic standards. One could argue, therefore, that if including arts and culture within the school day makes the children happier, then this would be likely to make parents more likely to choose that school. **(Boulton, P., Coldron, J., 'Happiness' as a criterion of parents' choice of school', *Journal of Education Policy*, 6 (2), 1991, pp. 169-178, SEE APPENDIX 33).**

The comparison of choice of local schools in London and Paris showed that although policy is different and differently perceived on the two sides of the Channel, its influence on the educational strategies of middle class parents is less important than that of values and the way values interact with contexts and resources. These intellectual, liberal, 'caring' parents broadly shared a very similar view of what constitutes a good education (and arguably an attractive school). To middle class parents, there was considerable consistency in what made a school attractive. This included intellectual development of the child, good academic results and a happy school experience at the individual level, as well as a concern for equality and integration at the collective level. Once again it could be argued, that if the arts in school increased happiness and improved social and collective equality, it would be perceived as increasing school attractiveness. Conversely, though, this must not in any way lead to a decrease in intellectual or academic success, so in other words, all good things need to go together. **(Raveaud, M., Zanten, A., 'Choosing the local school: middle class parents' values and social and ethnic mix in London and Paris', *Journal of Education Policy*, 22 (1), 2007, pp. 107-124)**

Attractiveness for teachers

There are a number of factors that seem to positively influence teachers' perceptions of school attractiveness. These include:

- When they are able to bring in the full range of their pedagogic competences
- When they cooperate with colleagues as well as external partners
- When they are able to work in a climate of well-being
- When they are able to be themselves in a permanent learning process
- When they understand themselves as change agents

(Addison et al: *Understanding Art Education*, 2008)

(Burkhard; Hennessy: *Reflective Practices in Arts Education*, 2006)

(Brandstätter: *Musikerziehung in Frankreich und Deutschland*, 2007)

An OECD report on recruitment and retention of an effective teaching staff indicated the importance of informed leadership. There is little direct or indirect research between the arts and leadership development. Yet, the factors that were seen to enhance teacher recruitment and retention included factors such as teacher satisfaction, school effectiveness, improvement, capacity, teacher leadership, distributive leadership, organisational learning,

and development. Conferring professional autonomy to teachers also appears to enhance the attractiveness of the profession as a career choice and will improve the quality of the classroom teaching practice. Teachers who work together in a meaningful and purposeful ways have been found to be more likely to remain in the profession because they feel valued and supported in their work. Concurrently, pupils' positive perceptions of their teachers' directly promoted greater teacher participation in school enhanced academic self-concept and improved a teacher's engagement with school. Put simply, if the pupils were happy and learning well and if the leadership were encouraging teacher autonomy then teachers were likely to work harder, be happier and stay longer. There is some research evidence that suggests that inclusion of the arts and creative processes in the classroom can increase teacher satisfaction⁷. Conversely, while more research is needed to support this contention, there is equal evidence, albeit anecdotal, that where a system reverts to more centrally driven educational systems focusing on a 'back to basics' mantra, teachers' level of use of creative approaches and the arts falls and this is accompanied by an equal fall in teacher morale. **(Bill Mulford: *School Leaders: Changing roles and impact on teacher and social effectiveness*. A paper commissioned by the Education and Training Policy Division, OECD, for the Activity Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers, 2003)**

Attractiveness for school boards and administrators

Learning in and through the arts can develop complex and subtle aspects of the mind, argues Elliot Eisner. Offering an array of examples, Eisner describes different approaches to the teaching of the arts and shows how these refine forms of thinking. He argues that the inclusion of the arts in the school bring unique and valuable contributions to a child's development and provides evidence aimed at convincing policy makers and curriculum developers of the value of the arts in education. He also argues that the arts, in their own right, serve as a vehicle for illustrating high quality educational aspirations. **(Eisner, Elliot W.: *The Arts and the Creation of Mind*, Yale, 2002)**

There are a number of factors that seem to positively influence school boards', policy makers' or system administrators' perception of school attractiveness. These include:

- When schools meet the assessment criteria
- When the rates of early school leaving are low
- When arts and culture help developing clearly defined school profiles
- When schools in rural areas become cultural centres

⁷ Reported anecdotally in the evaluations of "Creative Partnerships" and in national studies conducted by Bamford in Denmark (2006) and Norway (2012) and in longitudinal research of early years teachers (Bamford et al, *When is Yesterday Coming Again*, 2007).

Anne Bamford has carried out a number of national reports in which the conditions of arts and cultural education in selected European countries are evaluated and where concrete recommendations for the school management and policy makers to improve school attractiveness are presented (e.g. **Bamford: *Kwaliteit en Consistentie: Arts and Cultural Education in Flanders, 2007***). In the German-speaking countries quite recently so called “Bildungsberichte” have been published including arts education issues to make visible the positive contributions that the arts can have for school development. In the Ruhrgebiet, a former mining and industrial area in the heart of Germany, policy makers together with private foundations commissioned for the first time a *Bildungsbericht* with a particular focus on arts education (**Regionalverband Ruhr: *Bildungsbericht Ruhr, 2012***). The same is true for Austria, as the National Education Research Institute (bifie) published in 2009 for the first time a national *Bildungsbericht*, in which arts education has been selected to be analysed as a current education policy priority (**Wimmer and Schad: *Kunst, Kultur und Bildung, 2009***).

Some research articles look more specifically at the ways to increase school attractiveness for school populations that suffer particular disadvantage. There are, for example, studies looking at the impact of the arts for children with Special Educational Needs (SEN), children from poor backgrounds, children from rural and isolated areas and children from immigrant backgrounds. For example, Bender evaluated the impact of working with an arts based school-profile in a deprived area. Specifically, she examined how intensive artistic work helped to integrate pupils with learning difficulties. The study focused on the difficulties and possibilities of engaging in aesthetic experiences and aesthetic learning to build self-awareness and self-reflexivity for more disadvantaged pupils. (**Bender, Saskia, *Kunst im Kern von Schulkultur – Ästhetische Erfahrung und ästhetische Bildung in der Schule, Wiesbaden, 2010***)

Other studies looked at ways school attractiveness may be enhanced through more culturally sensitive forms of teacher training or induction. For example, Brandstätter’s research analysed an exchange project that took place in the academic year 2004/2005 between trainee teachers at the Berlin University of the Arts and trainee music teachers at the “Institut Universitaire de Formation des Maîtres Aix/Marseille” (IUFM) in Aix and Marseilles. At the heart of the article is a brief presentation of the French school system and the role played by music teaching in France. Expounding on that, a critical examination of basic differences between the systems in Germany and France follows. Federalism versus centralism, general teacher training as a bachelor’s degree as opposed to an additional pedagogical qualification, the music teacher as an artist or a methodologist – these pairs of contrasting concepts encapsulate some of the central differences. Juxtaposing one system against the other along with the moral concepts associated with them raises awareness of the norms implicit in one’s own system. (**Brandstätter, Ursula: *„Musikerziehung in Frankreich und Deutschland. Erfahrungen und Überlegungen ausgehend von einem Austauschprojekt zwischen der Universität der Künste Berlin und dem Institut Universitaire de Formation des Maîtres Aix/Marseille“*, In: Malmberg, Isolde / Wimmer, Constanze (Hg.): *Communicating Diversity: Musik lehren und lernen in Europa, Augsburg, 2007, pp. 37 – 45***)

The study by Durando (2006) takes a more profound look at models of education and their implications at a system-wide level. He poses the questions, 'Who are the already existing stakeholders and networks, who empower culture, education and young people in Europe?' and 'What are examples of good practice?' The study compares the different examples of good practice to formulate recommendations and orientation for the European Commission for future projects. **(Durando, Marc, *Analyse des dispositifs et initiatives liant la culture et l'éducation, la formation ou la jeunesse dans les Etats membres, les pays candidats et les pays EEE. Inventory of best practices linking culture with education in the Member States, candidate countries and the EEA countries*, Nancy, 2006)**

Attractiveness for the community, economy and labour markets

There are a number of factors that seem to positively influence community's (including the cultural community) and employer's perception of school attractiveness. These include:

- School as an open learning centre
- School as a hub of local life
- When public life in the community is represented within school (tends to work best in primary schools and get lost in secondary schools)
- Presence of cultural institutions
- When graduates meet the requirements of the labour markets

(Keuchel; Aescht: *Hoch hinaus*, 2007)

(Arts Council England: *Public value and the arts in England*, 2007)

The arts within education provide one alternative for states looking to build the workforce of tomorrow. The arts can provide effective learning opportunities to the general student population, yielding increased academic performance, reduced absenteeism, and better skill-building. An even more compelling advantage is the striking success of arts-based educational programmes among disadvantaged populations, especially at-risk youth. For at-risk youth, that segment of society most likely to suffer from limited lifetime productivity, the arts contribute to lower recidivism rates; increased self-esteem; the acquisition of job skills; and the development of much needed creative thinking, problem solving and communications skills. **(Phil Psilos: 'The Impact of Arts Education on Workforce Preparation', in *Economic & Technology Policy Studies*, 2002).**

A perhaps longer connection could be drawn between whether improvements to the attractiveness of a school could in turn lead to community benefits. Anecdotally, parents and real estate agents are likely to suggest that school attractiveness can increase property prices in an area and promote individuals to move their family to fall within the catchment area of particular schools. There is some evidence to suggest that the arts revitalize

neighbourhoods and promote economic prosperity (**Costello 1998; SCDCAC 2001; Stanziola 1999; Walesh 2001**) and that the arts provide a catalyst for the creation of social capital and the attainment of important community goals (**Goss 2000; Matarasso 1997; Williams 1995**). Yet, more research would need to be conducted around the influence of school attractiveness caused directly or indirectly in the arts and overall community improvement. (**Joshua Guetzkow: *How the Arts Impact Communities: An introduction to the literature on arts impact studies, 2002***)

How might the arts contribute to school attractiveness?

Arguably there are two major contributions that the arts might make to school attractiveness. Firstly, specific 'learning in the arts' might increase cultural understanding, enjoyment and achievement and identity amongst other attributes. Some abilities can be particularly effectively learnt in the arts, such as exploring, imagining, observing and reflecting. While 'learning through the arts' might involve artistic and creative methods in making a range of other subject areas more attractive through, for example, a more practical approach, greater uses of visualization, enhanced motivation, increased attentiveness and improved communication and critical reflection (amongst a range of positive benefits of more art-rich pedagogy). Learning through the arts can promote the development of other competences like intercultural understanding, entrepreneurship or, put simply, learning to learn. (**Bamford: *The Wow Factor, 2006***).

The pedagogical concept of the "Helene-Lange-Schule" looks for different forms of learning, where the main emphasis lies on the autonomy of the pupils. Through creating in the arts, researching in the sciences and organising their school-life themselves pupils gain self-confidence. The teachers found their individual and collegial teaching and learning plans could dovetail with the different projects and subjects within a common curriculum. As an organic approach to planning, centred on the arts, this concept meant that the school develops into "a living environment" for teachers, pupils and parents.

School can be attractive (or not attractive) in many different ways. For example:

- By offering a balance of learning provision;
- By acting learners' centered;
- Including the "world experiences" of the learners,
- Stimulating "hands-on" approaches
- Establishing a more equal relationship between teacher and learner.

There are very few studies that show a direct connection between the arts as a factor initiating better pedagogy that enhances the overall attractive of the learning environment. Certainly, Arts Education cannot easily fit into a rigid system of 50-minute lessons. There is evidence that suggests that more project orientated learning approaches (often common in

the arts) provide better and more sustainable results in terms of teaching and learning (**EDUCULT: *Evaluationsbericht zu Kultur.Forscher!*, 2011**).

A study conducted in the UK that looked at young people's motivation for engagement surmised that more engaged pupils would also have a direct positive bearing on school attractiveness, and would be certainly likely to reduce school dropouts. Pupils were most likely to be (and feel) engaged where they had a sense of achievement, growth and enjoyment. Arguably, these characteristics are more likely in the arts activities as these are not likely to have 'right and wrong' answers nor pre-determined age related outcomes. According to the study, adolescents placed a high value on activities that allowed them to meet new people and make friends. Similarly, they wanted to gain skills and feel they were helping improve society or solve a problem. Once again, it could be argued that arts and cultural activities are the most likely part of a secondary school curriculum to include these social and cultural aspects that were so highly rated by the young people studied. It is important to note, that these factors were consistently listed both as factors that would encourage them (young people) to start something and factors that would encourage them to increase or sustain their level of engagement. (**Lucy Lee and Gareth Morrell and Annalisa Marini and Sarah Smith: *Barriers and facilitators to pro-social behaviour among young people: a review of existing evidence*, Research Report DFE-RR188, Department of Education, England, 2010**)

Under which circumstances arts in school may generate such impact?

The UNESCO Road Map for Arts Education (2006)⁸ suggests a responsibility for all governments to promote and activate a vision of arts and cultural education 'for all'. This vision is for a sustained engagement with high arts experiences, as audiences, participants, creators and leaders. The Road Map (and subsequent Seoul Agenda, 2010⁹) is in keeping with international and national research and is premised on the evidence that suggests that participation in high quality cultural experiences has beneficial impacts on children and young people's skills, knowledge and behaviours.

From the outset, it was acknowledged that not all children and young people have equal access to cultural provisions nor is the quality and distribution of arts and cultural opportunities conducive to having equal effects for all children.

For the positive impacts of arts education on school attractiveness outlined previously in this paper to become apparent, children must experience high quality arts education. The results

⁸ UNESCO, *Road Map for Arts Education* (2006). http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=30335&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

⁹ In publication, based on the 2nd World Summit on Arts Education, Seoul, May 23-28, 2010.

from the global study of arts education¹⁰ suggest that in around ¼ of all instance of arts education, the quality is so low as to negatively affect a child's artistic and creative development. Given this, it is imperative that the arts education reaches certain levels of quality, and this quality is available for **all** children.

Related to arts and cultural experiences, we know that quality programmes have a number of measurable characteristics in common, such as inclusion of partnerships, performances and approaches but equally they depend on attitudes of risk taking, collaboration, sharing and other abstract constructs. 'Quality' here is defined as those arts and cultural provisions that are of recognised high value and worth in terms of the skills, attitudes and performativity engendered. Under this definition, quality is considered to exist as something that may include achievements (i.e. quality outputs), but goes beyond this to consider journeys, pathways, partnerships and celebration. The UNESCO Road Map on Arts Education establishes 10 consistently held quality beacons. These quality indicators are:

1. Active partnerships between schools and arts organizations and between teachers, artists and the community
2. Shared responsibility for planning, implementation and assessment and evaluation
3. Opportunities for public performance, exhibition and/or presentation;
4. A combination of development within the specific art forms (education in the arts) with artistic and creative approaches to learning, social change, cultural or environmental environment (education through the arts)
5. Provision for critical reflection, problem solving and risk taking
6. Emphasis on collaboration
7. Flexible structures and permeable boundaries
8. Accessibility to all
9. Detailed strategies for assessing, monitoring, evaluating and reporting
10. Ongoing professional learning for teachers, artists and the community

All quality programmes are (or should be) built around the notion of inclusivity and arts-rich education for all. This means that all children, regardless of artistic skills and abilities, initial motivation, behaviour, economic status or other entering attribute, should be entitled to receive high standard arts provisions, both within the various art forms and using creative and artistic approaches within other areas of the curriculum. This is a particularly important point in relation to initiatives to provide education for all and to look at greater inclusion of a variety of marginalized groups within general education. To meet a baseline in terms of quality arts education, education providers need to ensure that there are arts programmes for ALL children. Providing classes for talented or interested students only cannot be considered as providing a comprehensive education for all.

¹⁰ Bamford, A., *The Wow Factor: Global research compendium on the impact of arts in education*. Munich: Waxmann, 2006.

It also appears to be the case from the national studies undertaken¹¹ that to have high quality provisions, it may be necessary to achieve **all** of the ten criteria outlined above, as quality tends to fall quite rapidly if a school does not give due attention to one or more of the criteria. So in summary, there is strong evidence to suggest that arts education programmes can either directly or indirectly boost school attractiveness, but these benefits will only be apparent when sustained, quality arts education programmes are in place.

Conclusions and recommendations

The reasons for including arts as part of a child's education are clearly outlined in the UNESCO Road Map (2007)¹² and the majority of education systems in the world have arts and cultural education as a part of compulsory curricula. Despite this seemingly positive outlook, the challenge of delivering a universal, high quality, cultural offer for **all** children has not been achieved. The research evidence highlights the challenges of monitoring and accountability and the role of quality. There are a number of competing pressures that act to encourage and discourage children's and schools' participation in the arts.

There is **strong evidence** to suggest that:

- 1) Including the arts and culture in a sustained, high quality manner promotes a more 'liberal' and broad curriculum and this leads to improved academic attainment which can increase school attractiveness to parents and policy makers.
- 2) The arts improve the social climate of the school and reduce negative social interactions and anti-social behavior. This directly improves pupils' perceptions of school and increases the likelihood of the school being seen as being an attractive place by the pupils and teachers.
- 3) The inclusion of the arts in the school day provides opportunities for communication and emotional development not generally part of other school subjects. An improved emotional connection between pupils and teachers is shown to improve school attractiveness to pupils.

There is **some evidence** to suggest that an arts rich school may have:

- 1) Improved quality of teaching and leadership (including cultural sensitivities)
- 2) More effective practice for working with pupils with special educational needs

¹¹ Bamford, A, *Arts and Cultural Education in Norway* National Center for Arts and Cultural Learning, on behalf of the Norwegian Directorate of Education, 2011. Bamford, A, Chan, R and Leong, S., *Quality People Quality Life: Developing Hong Kong into a Creative Metropolis through Arts Education*. Bureau of Education, Hong Kong, 2011. Bamford, A, *Arts and Cultural Education in Iceland*, Icelandic Ministry For Education and Culture, 2009. Bamford, A, *Netwerken en verbindingen: Arts and Cultural Education in The Netherlands*, Dutch Ministry for Education, Culture and Sport, 2007. Bamford, A *Kwaliteit en Consistentie: Arts and Cultural Education in Flanders*. CANON Cultural Unit, Ministry for Education Flanders, 2007. Bamford, A and Qvortrup M, *An Ildsjæl in the Classroom*, Copenhagen, The Danish Arts Council, 2006.

¹² UNESCO (2006).

There is weaker evidence to suggest that arts rich schools may have:

- 1) A positive impact on future employability

Within the wealth of educational research available, there are only a limited number of studies that are specific to the impact of the arts. Despite strong correlative suggestion that the arts might significantly boost a number of aspects around school attractiveness and pupil achievement, very little research has been conducted into the role of the arts within the broader field of the education sciences. **Specifically, more research studies need to be conducted into:**

1. The impact of the arts on school attractiveness in terms of attracting and retaining effective school leaders and quality teachers
2. The impact of the arts on school attractiveness in terms of pupil retention and reduction in school 'drop outs' (reducing early school leaving)
3. The impact of the arts on school attractiveness in terms of improving employability and or community perceptions of pupils from particular school settings
4. The comparative impact of the arts on school attractiveness in terms of different school 'client' groups such as those from different social classes, levels of aspiration, boys and girls, rural and/or city children, those with special education needs and so on.
5. More specific research about exactly the type and quality of arts experiences (including across the different art forms) lead to particular levels of positive impact on school attractiveness.

These topics are not adequately covered by existing literature and would require the commissioning of additional research within the EU. In a more general sense, to date, there has been limited comparable data collected about the amount of arts education occurring in schools or the quality of those programmes. As this information is not routinely collected, it is not possible (as it is with other subjects) to do more detailed correlational or data matching studies to determine national or pan-national patterns. One recommendation could be for schools, local systems and national platforms to more routinely collect comparable data on the arts as they currently do for literacy, numeracy, and the sciences.

It also has to be cautioned, that while the majority of research supports a correlation between enhanced school attractiveness and the arts, there are a limited number of studies where either no correlation or a negative correlation exists between school attractiveness and the arts. For example, von Rossberg-Gempton et al. (1999) found that children who took part in a creative dance programme had lower self-construct scores than those who did not. (SEE APPENDIX 12). Similarly, Wright et al. (2006) found that there was no difference in social skills presented by children who did and did not take part in a structured multi-component arts programme targeted at low-income communities. (SEE APPENDIX 14).

References

- Addison, Nicholas, and Burgess, Lesley, *Understanding Art Education: Engaging reflexively with practice*, Taylor & Francis, 2008.
- Arts Council England, *Public value and the arts in England: Discussion and conclusion of the arts debate*, London, 2007. See http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/publication_archive/public-value-and-the-arts-in-england-discussion-and-conclusions-of-the-arts-debate/.
- Bamford, Anne, *Arts and Cultural Education in Norway*, National Center for Arts and Cultural Learning, on behalf of the Norwegian Directorate of Education, 2011.
- Bamford, Anne; Chan, Rachel; and Leong, Samuel, *Quality People Quality Life: Developing Hong Kong into a Creative Metropolis through Arts Education*. Bureau of Education, Hong Kong, 2011. See http://www.innofoco.com/OurService_09.htm
- Bamford, Anne, *Wow it's music next: Impact evaluation of wider opportunities programme in music at key stage 2*. Federation of Music Services/Department for Children, Schools and Families, 2010. See <http://www.thefms.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/02/iawo-complete-and-final-rosis-amendments270110.pdf>
- Bamford, Anne, *Arts and Cultural Education in Iceland*, Icelandic Ministry For Education and Culture, 2009. See http://bella.mrn.stjr.is/utgafur/arts_and_culture_anne_bamford.pdf
- Bamford, Anne and Glinkowski, Paul, *Knowledge and Insight: An evaluation of the 10 years of the SCIART Programme*, Wellcome Trust, 2009. See <http://www.scribd.com/doc/21794853/Insight-and-Experience-An-evaluation-of-the-Wellcome-Trust-s-Sciart-programme>
- Bamford, Anne and Glinkowski, Paul, *Fostering Innovation, Catalysing Change: Assessing the impact of the NESTA Fellowship Awards*, NESTA, 2009. See <http://www.nesta.org.uk/library/documents>
- Bamford, Anne, *Creative Partnerships Artists Training Programme*, London: Arts Council England, 2008. See <http://www.engineerroomcogs.org/publications.html>
- Bamford, Anne, *An evaluative report of arts in prisons*, Canterbury: Anne Peaker Centre for Arts in Criminal Justice (APC), 2007. See http://ec.europa.eu/education/grundtvig/doc/conf11/doc1-background_en.pdf
- Bamford, Anne, *Netwerken en verbindingen: Arts and Cultural Education in The Netherlands*, Dutch Ministry for Education, Culture and Sport, 2007. See <http://english.minocw.nl/english/culture/index.html>
- Bamford, Anne, *Kwaliteit en Consistentie: Arts and Cultural Education in Flanders*, CANON Cultural Unit, Ministry for Education Flanders, 2007. See <http://www.ond.vlaanderen.be/publicaties/eDocs/pdf/301.pdf>
- Bamford, Anne, "When is yesterday coming again?": *Creativity Matters: The Arts in Early Years*. London Borough of Ealing, 2007. See http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/media/uploads/downloads/CSS_casestudies.pdf and <http://www.engineerroomcogs.org/publications/35-when-is-yesterday-coming.html>
- Bamford, Anne and Qvortrup, Matt, *The Ildsjæl in the Classroom*, Copenhagen: The Danish Arts Council, 2006. See http://www.kunst.dk/db/files/the_ildsjael_in_the_class_room.pdf
- Bamford, Anne, *The Wow Factor: Global Research Compendium on the Impact of the Arts in Education*, Munich: Waxmann, 2006.

- Bamford, Anne, *The Global Research Compendium on the Impact of the arts in Education*, in UNESCO Asia-Pacific Regional Conference Report, 2005, pp. 233-242. See <http://www.ifacca.org/media/files/educationreport.pdf>
- Bamford, Anne, *Education and Arts Partnership Initiative: National Report*, Australia Council for the Arts, 2004. See http://www.australiacouncil.gov.au/research/arts_marketing/audience_development/the_education_and_arts_partnership_initiative
- Becker, Gerold, *Das andere Lernen – Entwurf und Wirklichkeit*, Hamburg, 1997.
- Becker, Helle, *Abschlussbericht zum Evaluationsvorhaben im Rahmen des Projekts "Kultur macht Schule" der Bundesvereinigung Kulturelle Kinder- und Jugendbildung e.V.*, Remscheid, 2007.
- Bender, Saskia, *Kunst im Kern von Schulkultur – Ästhetische Erfahrung und ästhetische Bildung in der Schule*, Wiesbaden, 2010.
- Bigelow, I.L., *Assessing the relationship between participation in the performing arts in schools and communication apprehension*, Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences M1–58: 0714, 1997.
- Bilhartz, T.D., Bruhn, R.A., Olson, J.E., 'The effect of early music training on child cognitive development', *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology* 20(4), 1999, pp. 615-636.
- Boulton, P.; and Coldron, J., 'Happiness' as a criterion of parents' choice of school', *Journal of Education Policy*, 6(2), 1991, pp. 169-178.
- Brandstätter, Ursula, 'Musikerziehung in Frankreich und Deutschland. Erfahrungen und Überlegungen ausgehend von einem Austauschprojekt zwischen der Universität der Künste Berlin und dem Institut Universitaire de Formation des Maîtres Aix/Marseille', in Malmberg, Isolde, and Wimmer, Constanze (Ed.): *Communicating Diversity: Musik lehren und lernen in Europa*, Augsburg, 2007, pp. 37 – 45.
- Braun, Tom; Fuchs, Max; and Kelb, Viola, *Auf dem Weg zur Kulturschule. Bausteine zu Theorie und Praxis der Kulturellen Schulentwicklung*, Munich, Kopaed, 2010.
- Bresler, Liora, *International Handbook of Research in Arts Education*, Dordrecht, 2007.
- Burkhard, Pamela, and Hennessy, Sarah (Ed.) *Reflective Practices in Arts Education*, Dordrecht, 2006.
- Catterall J. S., 'Enhancing peer conflict resolution skills through drama: an experimental study', *Research in Drama Education* 12(2), 2007, pp.163-178.
- Catterall J.S., and Pepler, K.A. 'Learning in the visual arts and the world views of young children', *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 37(4), 2007, pp. 543–560.
- Centre Pompidou, *Evaluating the Impact of Arts and Cultural Education – A European and International Research Symposium*, Paris, 2008.
- Cooper, L.; Benton, T.; and Sharp, C. *The Impact of Creative Partnerships on Attainment and Attendance in 2008-9 and 2009-10*. Slough: NFER, 2011.
- Costa-Giomi, E., 'Effects of three years of piano instruction on children's academic achievement, school performance and self-esteem', *Psychology of Music* 32, 2004, pp. 139-152
- Costello, Donal Joseph, 'The Economic and Social Impact of the Arts on Urban and Community Development', in *Dissertation Abstracts International, A: The Humanities and Social Sciences*, University of Pittsburgh, 1998.

- Cultural Learning Alliance (CLA), *ImagineNation - The Case for Cultural Learning*, London, CLA / Clore Duffeld Foundation, 2011. See <http://www.culturallearningalliance.org.uk/page.aspx?p=100>.
- Cultural Learning Alliance (CLA), *The Case for Cultural Learning – Key Research Findings*, London, CLA / Clore Duffeld Foundation, 2011. See http://www.culturallearningalliance.org.uk/userfiles/files/Key_Research_Findings.pdf.
- Cziboly, Adam (ed.), *DICE – Drama Improves Lisbon Key Competences in Education*, 2010. See http://www.dramanetwork.eu/policy_paper.html
- Durando, Marc, *Analyse des dispositifs et initiatives liant la culture et l'éducation, la formation ou la jeunesse dans les Etats membres, les pays candidats et les pays EEE. Inventory of best practices linking culture with education in the Member States, candidate countries and the EEA countries*, Nancy, 2006. See http://ec.europa.eu/culture/key-documents/culture-and-education_en.htm
- EDUCULT, *Evaluationsbericht zu Kultur.Forscher!*, EDUCULT / Deutsche Kinder- und Jugendstiftung, 2011. See http://www.kultur-forscher.de/fileadmin/system/dokumente/Relaunch_2012/Evaluationsbericht/KuFo-Abschlussbericht2011_lang.pdf.
- EDUCULT, *Kulturelle Bildung und berufsbildende Schulen*, Vienna, 2010.
- Egermann, Eva, and Protz, Anna (Ed.), *School works – Beiträge zu vermittelnder, künstlerischer und forschender Praxis*, Vienna, 2009.
- Eisner, Elliot W., *The Arts and the Creation of Mind*, Yale University Press, 2002.
- Eurydice, *Arts and Cultural Education at School in Europe*, Brussels, 2009. Full report and national data available at http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/education/eurydice/thematic_studies_en.php#2009.
- Fleming, M.; Merrell, C.; Tymms, P., 'Impact of drama on pupils' language, mathematics, and attitude in two primary schools', *Research in Drama Education* 9(2), 2004, pp. 177–197.
- Freeman, G.D., *Effects of creative drama activities on third and fourth grade children*, Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences M1–61: 3470, 2001.
- Geier, Thomas, *Schlüsselkompetenzen durch kulturelle Bildung. Eine Expertise. Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse einer qualitativen Befragung unter jungen Erwachsenen*, Remscheid, 2006.
- Gerver, Richard, *Creating tomorrow's schools today*, Network Continuum Education, 2010.
- Goss, Kristin, *Bettertogether: the report of the Saguro Seminar on Civic Engagement in America*, Harvard University, 2000. See <http://www.bettertogether.org/thereport.htm>.
- Groves, Malcolm, and Baumber, John, *Regenerating Schools: Leading the Transformation of Standards and Services through Community Engagement*, Network Continuum, 2008.
- Guetzkow, Joshua, 'How the Arts Impact Communities: An introduction to the literature on arts impact studies', prepared for the *Taking the Measure of Culture Conference*, Princeton University, Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, 2002. See <http://www.princeton.edu/~artspol/workpap/WP20%20-%20Guetzkow.pdf>.
- Holt, David, *Primary Arts Education: contemporary issues*, Routledge, 1997.
- Hui A., and Lau, S., 'Drama education: a touch of the creative mind and communicative-expressive ability of elementary school children in Hong Kong', *Thinking Skills and Creativity* 1(1), 2006, pp. 34–40.

- Kahl, Reinhard, *Individualisierung. Das Geheimnis guter Schulen*, Weinheim, 2011 (book and DVD)
- Kendall, L.; Morrison, J.; Yeshanew, T.; Sharp, C., *The longer-term impact of creative partnerships on the attainment of young people: results from 2005 and 2006. Final report*. Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research, 2008.
- Keuchel, Susanne, and Aesch, Petra, *Hoch Hinaus. Potenzialstudie zu Kinder- und Jugendkulturprojekten*, PwC Stiftung, 2007. See http://www.pwc.de/de/engagement/assets/PwC_Stiftung_Potenzialstudie_2007.pdf.
- Kim, J., Wigram, T., and Gold C. 'The effects of improvisational music therapy on joint attention behaviors in autistic children: a randomized controlled study', *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 38(9), 2008, pp. 1758–1766.
- Krahe, B., and Knappert, L., 'A group-randomized evaluation of a theatre-based sexual abuse prevention programme for primary school children in Germany', *Journal of Community and Applied Psychology* 19(4), 2009, pp. 321–329.
- Kulturprojekte Berlin GmbH, *Jugendliche befragen Jugendliche: Kunst und Kultur in Berlin – was geht mich das an? Eine Peer-to-Peer-Umfrage der Kulturprojekte Berlin GmbH*, Berlin, 2010.
- Lee, Lucy; Morrell, Gareth; Marini, Annalisa; and Smith, Sarah, *Barriers and facilitators to pro-social behaviour among young people: a review of existing evidence*, research report DFE-RR188, Department of Education, UK, 2010. See <https://www.education.gov.uk/publications/eOrderingDownload/DFE-RR188.pdf>.
- Lenzen, Dieter (ed), *Kunst und Pädagogik – Erziehungswissenschaften auf dem Weg zur Ästhetik*, Darmstadt, 1990.
- Lichtwark, Alfred (ed), *Berichte zu den Kunsterzieherkongressen*, 1900, 1902 and 1904.
- MacKenzie, P., 'School choice in an international context', *Journal of Research in International Education*, 9(2), 2010, pp. 107-123.
- Matarasso, François, *Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in the Arts*, Comedia, 1997. See http://web.me.com/matarasso/one/research/Entries/2009/2/19_Use_or_Ornament_files/Use%20or%20Ornament.pdf.
- Medňanská, Irena, 'Die Grund-Kunstschule im slowakischen Schulwesen', in Malmberg, Isolde, and Wimmer, Constanze (Ed.): *Communicating Diversity: Musik lehren und lernen in Europa*, Augsburg, 2007.
- Merrell, R., *The impact of a drama intervention program on the response of the bystander to bullying situations*, Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences M1–65: 2503, 2005.
- Mulford, Bill, 'School Leaders: Changing Roles and Impact on Teacher and Social Effectiveness', a paper commissioned by the Education and Training Policy Division, OECD, for the Activity 'Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers', 2003. See <http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/61/61/2635399.pdf>.
- National Center for Educational Statistics, *Extracurricular Participation and Student Engagement*, NCES 95-741, US, 1995. See <http://nces.ed.gov/pubs95/web/95741.asp>.
- Psilos, Phil, 'The Impact of Arts Education on Workforce Preparation', *Economic and Technology Policy Studies*, issue brief, 2002. See <http://www.nga.org/files/live/sites/NGA/files/pdf/050102ARTSED.pdf>.
- Putz-Plecko, Barbara and Wimmer, Michael, *Schule als kulturelles Zentrum*, Vienna, 2009.

- Raveaud, M.; and Zanten, A., 'Choosing the local school: middle class parents' values and social and ethnic mix in London and Paris', *Journal of Education Policy*, 22(1), 2007, pp. 107-124.
- Regionalverband Ruhr (ed), *Bildungsbericht Ruhr*, Münster, 2012.
- Robinson, Ken, *Out of our Minds: learning to be creative*, Oxford, 2001.
- Robinson, Ken, et al., *All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education. Report to the Secretary of State for Education and Employment and the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport*, London, 1999.
- Robinson, Ken, *Culture, Creativity and the Young: developing public policy*, Strasbourg, 1999.
- Sammons, Pam; Sylva, Kathy; Melhuish, Edward; Siraj-Blatchford, Iram; Taggart, Brenda; Draghici, Diana; Smees, Rebecca; and Toth, Katalin, *Effective Pre-school, Primary and Secondary Education Project (EPPSE 3-14) Influences on students' development in Key Stage 3: Social-behavioural outcomes in Year 9*. Department for Education, UK, 2012. See <https://www.education.gov.uk/publications/eOrderingDownload/DFE-RB184b.pdf>.
- SCDCAC, 'The arts and culture in San Diego: economic impact report, 2000', City of San Diego Commission for Arts and Culture, 2000.
- Schiller, Friedrich, *Über die ästhetische Erziehung des Menschen*, 1793.
- Schneider, Wolfgang (ed), *Theater und Schule – Ein Handbuch zur kulturellen Bildung*, Bielefeld, 2009.
- Stanziola, Javier, *Arts, Government and Community Revitalization*, Ashgate, 1999.
- Streibel, Robert (ed), *Eugenie Schwarzwald und ihr Kreis*, Vienna, 1996.
- Stöger, Christine, *Kunst in der Schule. Studien zur Reformpädagogik in Österreich unter besonderer Berücksichtigung des Musikunterrichtes*, Frankfurt a. Main et. Al., 2001.
- Timmerberg, Vera, and Schorn, Brigitte (ed) *Neue Wege der Anerkennung von Kompetenzen in der Kulturellen Bildung*, Munich, 2009.
- UNESCO, *Road Map for Arts Education*, UNESCO, 2006. See http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=30335&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html
- von Rossberg-Gempton, I.E.; Dickinson, J.; and Poole, G. 'The potential for enhancing psychomotor and cognitive functioning in frail seniors and young children through creative dance', *Journal of Human Movement Studies* 37(5), 1999, pp. 235-260.
- Walesh, Kim, and Henton, Doug, 'The Creative Community – Leveraging Creativity and Cultural Participation for Silicon Valley's Economic and Civic Future', Collaborative Economics, 2001
- Wildbad Kreuth, *Ist kulturelle Bildung messbar*, 2007. See <http://www.unesco.de/1407.html>
- Williams, Deirdre, *Creating Social Capital: a study of the long-term benefits from community-based arts funding*, Community Arts Network of South Australia, 1995.
- Wimmer, Michael, and Schad, Anke, 'Kunst, Kultur und Bildung: Kulturelle Bildung als Herausforderung an das Schulwesen. Ansätze, Erfahrungen und Entwicklungsmöglichkeiten. In: Bundesinstitut für Bildungsforschung, Innovation und Entwicklung', in Specht, Werner (ed.), *Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich 2009. Band 2: Fokussierte Analysen bildungspolitischer Schwerpunktthemen*, Graz, Nationaler Bildungsbericht, 2009, pp. 183-202. See http://www.bmukk.gv.at/medienpool/17992/nbb_band2.pdf.
- Woods, Philip A.; Bagley, Carl; and Glatter, Ron, *School choice and competition: markets in the public interest*, London, Routledge, 1998.

- Wright R.; John, L.; Ellenbogen, S.; Offord, D.R.; Duku, E.K.; and Rowe, W. 'Effect of a structured arts program on the psychosocial functioning of youth from low-income communities: findings from a Canadian longitudinal study', *Journal of Early Adolescence* 26(2), 2006, pp. 186-205

Appendix

The appendix contains a range of relevant research articles pertinent to the topic of the impact of arts education on school attractiveness. Each article has been categorised as being high, medium or low in terms of the overall weight of the evidence it provides.

APPENDIX 1

Catterall J. S., 'Enhancing peer conflict resolution skills through drama: an experimental study', *Research in Drama Education* 12(2), 2007, pp.163-178

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'This article explores learning in drama through contemporary theories of knowledge acquisition' (p.2) 'A primary goal was enhancing prosocial behavior....'(p.9)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills 1. Conditions and processes of learning (meta-cognitive skills, self-efficacy, general outlook) 2. Pro-social changes in behaviour (ability to work with others when disagreeing, ability to work effectively in groups, problem resolution skills) (pp.17-18)</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 'The principal means of generating and gathering data was through surveys administered to all students prior to the program and again after completion of the program...The items in the survey instrument were supplemented with questions based on standard instruments designed to assess student attitudes and motivation.' (p.10)</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? USA</p> <p>Number of participants 71 (intervention), 84 (control) (p.10)</p> <p>Age of participants 11-15 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Secondary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Not stated</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? BME, low SES (high proportion of participants from these groups)</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: the 'School Project'.</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Arts (multi-component): 'The program used theatre, movement, and writing, as well as voice, drawing, and visual arts exercises as building blocks for students to write and perform original plays. On one of the appointed days, all students were taken to see a professional play' (p.8)</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School-based extra-curricular clubs</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 24 weeks</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 90 minute workshops once a week</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual</p>
---	---	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts.* London. pp. 44-45.

APPENDIX 2

Catterall J.S., and Peppler, K.A. 'Learning in the visual arts and the world views of young children', *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 37(4), 2007, pp. 543–560.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? The broad aims were to investigate 'the effects of rich, sustained visual arts instruction on inner city 9-year-olds in two major US cities.'(p.543)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. General self-concept 2. Self-efficacy 3. Internal attributions for success 4. Perceived number of future choices Creativity: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Originality 2. Elaboration 3. Flexibility 4. Fluency </p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 'Survey items were drawn to establish multiitem scale</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? USA</p> <p>Number of participants 179 students took part (103 who attended ICA or COCA classes and 76 comparison class students). (p.552)</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed sex</p> <p>Any other important features of the participants There was one treatment (arts) and one control, but two different sites were used in the study (Los Angeles, St. Louis)</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? BME, low SES (participants almost exclusively from these groups)</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: 1. Inner City Arts (ICA) based in Los Angeles, 2. Centre of Contemporary Arts (COCA) based in St. Louis</p> <p>Arts participation Arts (multi-component): At ICA the activities were drawing, painting and sculpting. The programme at COCA involved creating visual art and writing poetry</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours) Other educational setting</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 20 weeks (ICA) 30 weeks (COCA)</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention About 90 minutes, twice per week (ICA) once per week for one-hour (COCA)</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual (assumed they received standard art classes)</p>
--	---	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp. 45-46.

APPENDIX 3

Hui A., and Lau, S. , Drama education: a touch of the creative mind and communicative-expressive ability of elementary school children in Hong Kong', *Thinking Skills and Creativity* 1(1), 2006, pp. 34–40

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? To examine 'the effect of drama education on the psychological development of grades 1 and 4 students.' (abstract)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills: Communicative-expressive ability Creativity: Thinking and drawing</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. Form A of the Wallach-Kogan creativity tests (WKCT) 2. Tests for creative thinking-drawing production (TCT-DP) 3. A story-telling test (STT) was designed and used to measure students' communicative-expressive ability. 4. Observation/video-taping</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Asia</p> <p>Number of participants It is reported that a total of 126 children were assigned to the experimental group and the control group included 69 children (p.35). However, Table 1 on p.37 suggests that only 61 (intervention) and 67 (control) actually took Part</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Primary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? No</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Arts (multi-component): drama project involving puppet making and creative drama (improvisation and story creation) (p.36)</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School-based extra-curricular clubs</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 16 weeks</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention One day each week</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Alternative intervention: 'non-aesthetic extracurricular activities, such as ball playing' (p.36)</p>
--	--	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp. 51.

APPENDIX 4

Kim, J., Wigram, T., and Gold C. 'The effects of improvisational music therapy on joint attention behaviors in autistic children: a randomized controlled study', *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 38(9), 2008, pp. 1758–1766.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/High

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'to investigate the effects of improvisational music therapy on joint attention behaviours in pre-school children with autism.' (Abstract)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Randomised controlled trial (Maryland Scale 5)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? 1. Joint attention skills 2. Pro-social behaviours</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. PDDBI (Pervasive Developmental Disorder Behaviour Inventory) 2. ESCS (a structured toy play assessment measuring non-verbal social communication skills) 3. Video</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Asia</p> <p>Number of participants 15 at recruitment 10 in final study</p> <p>Age of participants 0-5 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Not Stated</p> <p>Sex of participants Male</p> <p>Any other important features of the participants Participants had autism. Those that remained after drop-out were all boys</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? Limiting disability (children with autism)</p>	<p>Arts participation Arts (multi-component): improvisational music therapy</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 'Due to holidays and sick leave, it took the participants between 7 and 8 months to complete the 24 session program.' (pp.1759-60)</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Weekly, 30 minute sessions</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual: play session with toys</p>
---	--	--

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp. 53

APPENDIX 5

Bigelow, I.L., *Assessing the relationship between participation in the performing arts in schools and communication apprehension*, Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences M1–58: 0714, 1997.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'The purpose of this study is to examine the relationship between (a) participation in the performing arts within school curricula and (b) levels of communication apprehension.' (p.4)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills: 1.Communication skills</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Personal Report of Communication Apprehension-24 (PRCA-24)</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? USA</p> <p>Number of participants Alpha school: 35 Omega school: 33</p> <p>Age of participants 11-15 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Secondary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? No</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Arts (multi-component): performing arts course(instrumental and vocal music, drama and dance) (p.11)</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours)</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention One semester (p.48)</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 1-2 per week (assumed)</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? No treatment: core elective classes (but not performing arts classes)</p>
--	---	--

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp.43.

APPENDIX 6

Freeman, G.D., *Effects of creative drama activities on third and fourth grade children*, Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences M1–61: 3470, 2001.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/High

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'The purpose of this study was to determine the effects of creative drama activities on the self-concept, behaviour, and social skills of third and fourth year students.' (p.2)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Randomised controlled trial (Maryland Scale 5)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills 1. Social skills 2. Self-concept Truancy rates/behaviour problems Behaviour</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. The Student Self-Concept Scale (SSCS) was used to measure student self-concept. 2. The Social Skills Rating System (SSRS) was used to measure social skills and problem behaviour. 3. Behaviour was also measured using computer records of office referrals from the study year and the prior year.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? USA</p> <p>Number of participants 237 subjects participated: 119 from grade 3, 118 from grade 4; 120 in the intervention group, 117 controls</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Primary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? Mixed ethnicity and SES No</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Arts (multi-component): Creative drama activities</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours)</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 18 weeks</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention One day per week for 40 minutes</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual: 'regularly scheduled general music classes' (p.iv)</p>
---	---	--

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: *The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme*, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp.49.

APPENDIX 7

Merrell, R., *The impact of a drama intervention program on the response of the bystander to bullying situations*, Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences M1–65: 2503, 2005.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? The purpose of this study is to test the hypothesis that drama related to bullying improves the bystander's response to bullying situations</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Randomised controlled trial (Maryland Scale 5)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Actual reporting of bullying 2. Direct intervention in bullying situations 3. Attitudes about bullying <p>Which methods were used to collect the data?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Pre-Intervention Bullying Questionnaire Format A 2. Post-Intervention Bullying Questionnaire Format B 3. Reflection cards 	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? USA</p> <p>Number of participants Experimental (n=30) and control (n=30) groups. After the study began, one subject in experimental group was temporarily suspended, and three in the control group decided not to participate. Therefore, a total of 56 ninth graders (29 in intervention, 27 in control) were included. (p.81)</p> <p>Age of participants 11-15 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Secondary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? BME (large proportion of sample)</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: The 5 W's of Bullying Intervention</p> <p>Arts participation Arts (multi-component): Drama-based social-skills programme</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours)</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Unclear</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 7 sessions at 45 minutes</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual: 'The control group completed seven sessions of the regular Freshman Seminars, a programme focused on high school credits, careers and study skills given to all nine graders in the school.' (abstract)</p>
---	--	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp.55-56.

APPENDIX 8

Krahe, B., and Knappert, L., 'A group-randomized evaluation of a theatre-based sexual abuse prevention programme for primary school children in Germany', *Journal of Community and Applied Psychology* 19(4), 2009, pp. 321–329.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? To examine the efficacy of an intervention targeting first and second graders ... the first test of the efficacy of a theatre play called (No) Child's Play in promoting children's self-protective skills in terms of the understanding of situations potentially leading to abuse and in recognising appropriate behavioural responses in interactions with adults. (p.322)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Randomised controlled trial (Maryland Scale 5)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills: Self-protective skills</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Eight short scenarios were developed to measure gains in self-protective skills. The scenarios were followed by questions (answered by students) with four-point rating scale. (pp.324-5)</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants 'A total of 148 first and second graders (78 girls; average age 7.55 years ... range 6.1–9.1 years) participated in the study ... In total, there were 44 participants in the LIVE group, 55 participants in the DVD group and 49 in the control group.' (p.323)</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Primary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? No</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: (No) Child's Play</p> <p>Arts participation Theatre-based intervention (i.e. live performance of a play) to prevent sexual abuse</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Arts setting: theatre</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention One day or less</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Once</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? No treatment</p>
--	--	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts.* London. pp.53-54.

APPENDIX 9

Costa-Giomi, E., 'Effects of three years of piano instruction on children's academic achievement, school performance and self-esteem', *Psychology of Music* 32, 2004, pp. 139-152

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/High

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'to investigate the effects of piano instruction on children's development'</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Randomised controlled trial (Maryland Scale 5)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Academic achievement/skills</p> <p>If academic achievement is measured, what subjects does the study focus on? Literacy, Numeracy</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. Language and mathematics subtests: Level 14 of the Canadian Achievement Test 2 (CAT2) 2. Coopersmith Self-Esteem Inventories (long form) 3. Level E of the Developing Cognitive Abilities Test (DCAT) 4. Report cards for English, French, music and mathematics 5. Fine motor subtests of the Bruininks-Oseretsky Test of Motor Proficiency</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Canada</p> <p>Number of participants 117 children (58 girls, 59 boys) (p.142)</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Primary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Any other important features of the Participants 'The 117 children (58 girls and 59 boys) selected to participate in the study had never participated in formal music instruction, did not have a piano at home, and their family income was below \$40,000 Canadian (\$30,000 US at the time of the investigation) per annum. Approximately 25 per cent of the children had unemployed parents and 30 per cent lived with a single parent.' (p.142)</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? Low SES (intervention targeted at this group)</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts participation Play a musical instrument (piano/keyboard Instruction)</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours)</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 'Each child in the experimental group received.....three years of piano instruction and an acoustic piano.' p143</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 1-2 per week: 'The lessons were 30 minutes long during the first two years and 45 minutes during the third year.' p143.</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual</p>
---	--	--

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp.46-47.

APPENDIX 10

Fleming, M.; Merrell, C.; Tymms, P., 'Impact of drama on pupils' language, mathematics, and attitude in two primary schools', *Research in Drama Education* 9(2), 2004, pp. 177–197.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'This article reports on research which examined the impact of The National Theatre's Transformation drama project on young pupils' reading, mathematics, attitude, self-concept and creative writing in primary schools.' (p.177)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Academic achievement/skills Attitude to learning Attitude to mathematics, reading and school</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? UK</p> <p>Number of participants 165 students</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Any other important features of the Participants The primary schools were in the Shadwell and Limehouse areas of the East End of London (Borough of Tower Hamlets). A large number of the pupils were learning English as an additional language. (p.181). There were 2 intervention schools and 2 control schools.</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? Unclear/BME (many children were learning English as an additional language)</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: The National Theatre's Transformation drama project</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Arts (multi-component): 1. Write plays, perform plays 2. Part of the project involved three visits to the theatre (p.182)</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours) Arts setting (e.g. theatre/gallery)</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Just under 2 years. 'All Year 3 pupils were assessed in September 1999 ... They were then re-assessed at the end of Year 4 after two years of Transformation interventions.' (p.183)</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention "The broad pattern for working with the children was similar each year. It took place over two terms with serial workshops in the first term and a two-week block in the second. During the second stage, five drama workshops were conducted leading up to a celebratory sharing of the work in a venue outside schools. Part of the project involved three visits to the theatre to watch professional performances." (pp.181-2)</p>
--	---	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts*. London. pp.47-48.

APPENDIX 11

Kendall, L.; Morrison, J.; Yeshanew, T.; Sharp, C., *The longer-term impact of creative partnerships on the attainment of young people: results from 2005 and 2006. Final report.* Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research, 2008.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/High

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'The main aim of this report is to explore the relationship between taking part in Creative Partnerships activities, or attending a school which took part in the Creative Partnerships initiative, and academic attainment.' (p.8)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Well-matched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 4)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Academic achievement/skills Key Stage 2 and 3 assessments GCSEs</p> <p>If academic achievement is measured, what subjects does the study focus on? Literacy Numeracy Science</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. National Pupil Database (NPD) data 2. Attendance data collected during the national evaluation</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? UK</p> <p>Number of participants Number of young people in the analysis (Table A1, p.29) Key stage 2: 8,670* 12,102** 1,005,105*** Key stage 3: 6,493* 24,883** 1,104,907*** Key stage 4: 5,188* 23,921** 1,081,248*** * Young people known to have attended Creative Partnership activities **All young people in schools involved with Creative Partnerships in Phase 1 ***All young people nationally</p> <p>Number of schools in the analysis (Table A2, p.30) Key stage 2: 158* 14,126** Key stage 3: 73* 3,053** Key stage 4: 73* 3,034** *Schools involved with Phase 1 of Creative Partnerships **All schools nationally</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years 11-15 years 16-18 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Primary school Secondary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: Creative Partnerships</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Arts (multi-component): The programme supports innovative, long-term partnerships between schools and creative professionals including artists, performers, architects, multimedia developers and scientists.</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours)</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? No treatment: The models effectively compared the progress of three mutually exclusive groups of young people:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • those known to have attended Creative Partnerships activities • those in Creative Partnerships schools, but not known to have attended Creative Partnerships activities • those in non-Creative Partnerships schools
--	--	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts.* London. pp.51-52.

APPENDIX 12

von Rossberg-Gempton, I.E.; Dickinson, J.; and Poole, G. 'The potential for enhancing psychomotor and cognitive functioning in frail seniors and young children through creative dance', *Journal of Human Movement Studies* 37(5), 1999, pp. 235-260

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'The purpose of this study was to examine the potentiality of creative dance to enhance physical and cognitive functioning in seniors and young children in a rural setting.' (p.235)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Transferable skills: 1. Social skills 2. Affective skills Cognitive performance: 1. Cognitive abilities</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. The Cratty Self-Concept Scale 2. The 'happy/sad' faces scale 3. Questionnaire 4. WAIS-R and WISC-R intelligence tests 5. For children, the Bruininks-Oseretsky Test of Motor Proficiency was used</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Canada</p> <p>Number of participants A total of 78 people participated, 24 older adults and 53 children. The number of original participants (before dropout) was 89.</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years 19+ years (older adults)</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Primary school</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Any other important features of the participants 'The children's groups were composed of heterogeneous class distribution of special needs, bright and average children.' (p.239)</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? No</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts attendance and participation Creative dance programme</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School (in school hours) Residential home for the elderly</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 12 weeks</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 30 minutes, twice a week</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Alternative intervention: Children in a 'wait list' condition participated for 12 weeks in physical education (PE) activities such as stretching, skipping and participating in co-operative physical games.</p>
--	---	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts.* London. pp.62.

APPENDIX 13

Bilhartz, T.D., Bruhn, R.A., Olson, J.E., 'The effect of early music training on child cognitive development', *Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology* 20(4), 1999, pp. 615-636.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? To examine the relationship between participation in a structured music curriculum and cognitive development.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Unmatched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 3)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Cognitive performance</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. Parents or guardians were asked to complete a questionnaire about their children. (p.618) 2. Young Child Music Skills Assessment (MSA) 3. Stanford-Binet Intelligence Scale, fourth edition (SB)</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? USA</p> <p>Number of participants 71 participants: 36 (experimental treatment group) 35 (control group) (p.618)</p> <p>Age of participants 0-5 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Pre-school/nursery/kindergarten</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? No</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: Kindermusik for the Young Child Year 1 Pilot Programme</p> <p>Arts participation Arts (multi-component): 'The weekly lessons for the age group in this study involve vocal exploration and matching pitch, singing, playing percussion instruments and the glockenspiel, exploring and notating basic rhythms, learning to read and write music on a treble staff, composing, and developing coordination and balance through movement.' (p.620)</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 30 weeks (p.620)</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 75 minutes once weekly (p.620)</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual: '...children in the control group attended their respective preschools but received no additional in-class music treatment.' (p.620)</p>
---	--	---

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts.* London. pp.43-44.

APPENDIX 14

Wright R.; John, L.; Ellenbogen, S.; Offord, D.R.; Duku, E.K.; and Rowe, W. 'Effect of a structured arts program on the psychosocial functioning of youth from low-income communities: findings from a Canadian longitudinal study', *Journal of Early Adolescence* 26(2), 2006, pp. 186-205

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/High

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? 'to evaluate a community-based afterschool arts programs (combination of theatre, visual, and media arts) targeted to a low-income population. Of particular interest were whether participants would demonstrate regular and sustained attendance and whether the program would have an impact on their psychosocial functioning.' (p. 187)</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Well matched comparison group study (Maryland Scale 4)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Truancy rates/behaviour problems: 1.conduct 2.pro-social behaviour</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? 1. National Longitudinal Survey of Children and Youth (NLSCY) 2. Teacher observations of students and rating them on 6 assessments 3. PMK (person most knowledgeable) typically the mother, completed questionnaires on socio-demographic information and scales to assess family functioning</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Canada</p> <p>Number of participants 183</p> <p>Age of participants 6-10 years (at baseline) The programme itself was for 9-15 year olds; participants were followed up every two years.</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p> <p>Any other important features of the participants Data on the participants is taken from a longitudinal study. This survey constituted the data collection for the NAYDP (research that evaluates community-based, youth arts programmes in low-income communities). Five sites were selected for the implementation (and evaluation) of the arts programme. Therefore, the participants are from a range of 5 different sites. The population reflects an 'ethnically and culturally rich' cross-section of the Canadian population.</p> <p>Are outcomes reported for any of the priority groups? Low SES (intervention targeted at this group)</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: National Arts and Youth Demonstration Project (NAYDP)</p> <p>Arts participation Arts (multi-component): Combination of theatre, visual and media arts</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Unclear</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention 6 months (and 1 day) to 1 year</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention 90 minutes, twice a week</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? No treatment.</p>
--	---	--

Source: Department for Culture, Media and Sport: The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme, 2010. *Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport: a systematic review of the research of the learning outcomes for young people participating in the arts.* London. pp.63.

APPENDIX 15

Cooper, L.; Benton, T.; and Sharp, C. *The Impact of Creative Partnerships on Attainment and Attendance in 2008-9 and 2009-10*. Slough: NFER, 2011.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/High

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? ‘to explore the evidence that Creative Partnerships might be having an impact on young people’s attainment and attendance’ (p. 1)</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Academic achievement Attendance Levels</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Individual pupils were grouped within schools. Multilevel modelling was used to take account of the hierarchical structure of the data and produce more accurate predictions and estimates of the differences between students and between schools. Comparisons were made between schools engaged with Creative Partnerships and those not involved. (p.8)</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? England</p> <p>Number of participants Pupils involved in creative partnerships: 102,385 Schools involved in creative partnerships: 639 Pupils not involved in creative partnerships (control): 10,086,666 Schools not involved in creative partnerships (control): 20,915</p> <p>Age of participants Key stage 1-4</p> <p>Sex of participants Mixed Sex</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Yes: Creative Partnerships</p> <p>Arts participation “fosters long-term partnerships between schools and creative professionals. It brings creative workers such as artists, architects and scientists into schools to work with teachers to inspire young people and help them learn” (p.4)</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? School based</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Treatment as usual.</p>
--	--	--

Source: Cooper,L., Benton,T. and Sharp, C. (2011). *The Impact of Creative Partnerships on Attainment and Attendance in 2008-9 and 2009-10*. Slough: NFER

APPENDIX 16

Addison, Nicholas, and Burgess, Lesley, *Understanding Art Education: Engaging reflexively with practice*, Taylor & Francis, 2008.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? Understanding Art Education examines the theory and practice of helping young people learn in and beyond the secondary classroom. It provides guidance and stimulation for ways of thinking about art and design when preparing to teach and provides a framework within which teachers can locate their own experiences and beliefs.</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? What is distinctive about art and design as a subject in secondary schools? What contribution does it make to the wider curriculum? How can art and design develop the agency of young people?</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Experts in the field explore: The histories of art and design education and their relationship to wider social and cultural developments Creativity as a foundation for learning Engaging with contemporary practice in partnership with external agencies The role of assessment in evaluating creative and collaborative practices Interdisciplinary approaches to art and design Developing dialogue as a means to address citizenship and global issues in art and design education.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants NA</p> <p>Age of participants NA</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended NA</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? NA</p> <p>Arts participation All art forms</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Schools</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? NA</p>
--	---	---

Source: Addison, Nicholas/ Burgess, Lesley et al. (2008): *Understanding art education: engaging reflexively with practice*, Oxford

APPENDIX 17

Braun, Tom; Fuchs, Max; and Kelb, Viola, *Auf dem Weg zur Kulturschule. Bausteine zu Theorie und Praxis der Kulturellen Schulentwicklung*, Munich, Kopaed, 2010.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? The aim of a „Kulturschule“ ist: To strengthen the rights of children and young people of participation by emphasis on art and culture.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? How does it happen, that cultural practice becomes the centre of the whole life in school? Which requirements, qualifications and attitudes are necessary to make aesthetic and cultural approaches sustainable?</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? The book gives a survey in theory and practice of school development and combines the analysis of schools with the analysis of effects of arts in educational processes.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants NA</p> <p>Age of participants NA</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Schools and Culture schools</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Kulturschule</p> <p>Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? After school arts programmes</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? NA</p>
---	--	--

APPENDIX 18

Bresler, Liora, *International Handbook of Research in Arts Education*, Dordrecht, 2007.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? While research can at times seem distant from practice, the Handbook aims to maintain connection with the lived practice of art and of education, capturing the vibrancy and best thinking in the field of theory and practice.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? These areas include: History of arts education, curriculum, evaluation, cultural centers, appreciation, composition, informal learning, child culture, creativity, the body, spirituality, and technology. The individual chapters address cross-cultural research related to the central theme of the section from the perspectives of the particular arts discipline. Interludes provide reflective thoughts on the theme.</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Providing a distillation of knowledge in the various disciplines of arts education (dance, drama, music, literature and poetry and visual arts), the Handbook synthesizes existing research literature, helps define the past, and contributes to shaping the substantive and methodological future of the respective and integrated disciplines of arts education.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? International</p> <p>Number of participants Various</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Various</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? NA</p> <p>Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Various</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Various</p>
--	---	--

APPENDIX 19

Cultural Learning Alliance (CLA), *The Case for Cultural Learning – Key Research Findings*, London, CLA / Clore Duffeld Foundation, 2011.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? The Cultural Learning Alliance has published key findings demonstrating the impact of cultural learning on the lives of children and young people.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Meta review of all available large-scale English language data</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Amongst the findings, based on a review of all available large-scale English language data including from the US, funded by the Paul Hamlyn Foundation, are: Learning through arts and culture improves attainment in all subjects; Participation in structured arts activities increases cognitive abilities; Students from low-income families who take part in arts activities at school are three times more likely to get a degree; The employability of students who study arts subjects is higher and they are more likely to stay in employment; Students who engage in the arts at school are twice as likely to volunteer and are 20% more likely to vote as young adults.</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Various</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? International, English speaking</p> <p>Number of participants Large scale</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Various</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Cultural Learning Alliance Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Various</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? Sometimes</p>
--	---	---

APPENDIX 20

EDUCULT, *Evaluationsbericht zu Kultur.Forscher!*, EDUCULT / Deutsche Kinder- und Jugendstiftung, 2011.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? Cultural.Explorers! is a programme of the German Children and Youth Foundation (GYCF) and the PwC-Foundation Youth-Education-Culture</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Evaluated by EDUCULT</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Based on students' questions and with the help of teachers and experts from media-related professions, music, arts, libraries and other cultural institutions, each school develops its own 2 ½-year "Cultural.Explorers!" project. The idea is to establish long-term collaborative ties with external partners that will continue to exist beyond the duration of the programme. Working on their projects, children and young people act as "Cultural.Explorers!" observing everyday phenomena with a fresh outlook and gaining new knowledge about cultural phenomena in their immediate environment. Each school implementing its project idea receives extensive support in terms of scientific advising, professional development, networking opportunities with other "Cultural.Explorers!" schools, and financial support of up to 5,000 euros per year. The accompanying evaluation by EDUCULT aims at the systematic analysis of the programme and the generation of models for practice.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants 24 schools</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Schools in partnership with cultural organisations</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Cultural.Explorers!</p> <p>Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Funding and support is provided to a total of 24 schools ready to take their students, teachers, and at least one external partner on a research expedition into culture.</p> <p>Dialogue between the ones involved and the joint learning process is at the centre of the research process.</p> <p>Duration and intensity of the activity/intervention Funding and support is provided to a total of 24 schools ready to take their students, teachers, and at least one external partner on a research expedition into culture. Based on students' questions and with the help of teachers and experts from media-related professions, music, arts, libraries and other cultural institutions, each school develops its own 2 ½-year "Cultural.Explorers!" project.</p>
---	--	---

APPENDIX 21

Eisner, Elliot W.; and Day, Michael D. (ed), *Handbook of Research and Policy in Art Education*, New Jersey, 2004.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? Various</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Sponsored by the National Art Education Association and assembled by an internationally known group of art educators, this 36-chapter handbook provides an overview of the remarkable progress that has characterized this field in recent decades.</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Organized into six sections, it profiles and integrates the following elements of this rapidly emerging field: history, policy, learning, curriculum and instruction, assessment, and competing perspectives. Because the scholarly foundations of art education are relatively new and loosely coupled, this handbook provides researchers, students, and policymakers (both inside and outside the field) an invaluable snapshot of its current boundaries and rapidly growing content. In a nutshell, it provides much needed definition and intellectual respectability to a field that as recently as 1960 was more firmly rooted in the world of arts and crafts than in scholarly research.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants Various</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Various</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Various</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention Various</p>
---	--	--

Source: Various

APPENDIX 22

Gerver, Richard, *Creating tomorrow's schools today: education – our children – their futures*, Network Continuum Education, 2010.

Overall weight of evidence: Low/Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? Education is the platform for our success or failure, but is our system still fit for purpose? Will our children be equipped to face the challenges the future holds: the rapidly changing employment patterns and the global environmental, economic and social crises ahead of us? Or will our children grow up to resent their school years and blame them for their unfulfilled potential and achievement?</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation?</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report?</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data?</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants</p> <p>Age of participants</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended</p> <p>Sex of participants</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name?</p> <p>Arts participation</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention?</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive?</p>
--	--	---

APPENDIX 23

Groves, Malcolm, and Baumber, John, *Regenerating Schools: Leading the Transformation of Standards and Services through Community Engagement*, Network Continuum, 2008.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? <i>Regenerating Schools</i> examines the changes now needed if schools are to succeed in educating young people to live and work in a future we can scarcely begin to imagine. Using a mix of analysis and detailed studies of a number of schools in England and around the world, the book explores how some schools are already moving from imagination to success in their own context by acting upon key insights which change their relationship with their communities.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation?</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report?</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data?</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants</p> <p>Age of participants</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended</p> <p>Sex of participants</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name?</p> <p>Arts participation</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention?</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive?</p>
--	--	---

APPENDIX 24

Holt, David, *Primary Arts Education: contemporary issues*, Routledge, 1997.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? Primary arts (art, music, dance and drama) are gaining recognition as a subject and as support in the value they offer primary children. This text examines the problems and opportunities faced by educators as a result of recent education reforms and the implementation of the National Curriculum.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation?</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report?</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data?</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants</p> <p>Age of participants</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended</p> <p>Sex of participants</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name?</p> <p>Arts participation</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention?</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive?</p>
--	--	---

APPENDIX 25

Keuchel, Susanne, and Aescht, Petra, *Hoch Hinaus. Potenzialstudie zu Kinder- und Jugendkulturprojekten*, PwC Stiftung, 2007.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study?</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? The study chooses a quantitative and a qualitative approach. It describes projects in detail and extracts 104 attributes in 7 fields of assessment: the aspects of mediation, the potential of finding the target group, the project organisation, the framework requirements, the networks, the public resonance and the sustainability.</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report?</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data?</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants</p> <p>Age of participants</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended</p> <p>Sex of participants</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name?</p> <p>Arts participation</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention?</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive?</p>
---	--	---

APPENDIX 26

Medňanská, Irena, 'Die Grund-Kunstschule im slowakischen Schulwesen', in Malmberg, Isolde, and Wimmer, Constanze (Ed.): *Communicating Diversity: Musik lehren und lernen in Europa*, Augsburg, 2007.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? The text describes the particular way extra-musical education for Slovakian pupils is organised.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation?</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? The text describes the particular way extra-musical education for Slovakian pupils is organised at the so-called „elementary art schools“. The advantages and disadvantages of a school type are discussed that offers as its speciality the education of children and adolescents either in one artistic discipline or in several different ones at the same time. This makes polyaesthetic work possible that is found in “music schools” in virtually no other European country.</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data?</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants</p> <p>Age of participants</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended</p> <p>Sex of participants</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name?</p> <p>Arts participation</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention?</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive?</p>
--	--	---

APPENDIX 27

Robinson, Ken et al., *All Our Futures: creativity, culture and education: report to the Secretary of State for Education and Employment and the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport*, London (NACCCE report), 1999.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/high

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? This report argues that a national strategy for creative and cultural education is essential to that process.</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? The authors put the case for developing creative and cultural education; they consider what is involved and look at current provision and assess the opportunities and obstacles and set out a national strategy. By creative education is meant forms of education that develop young people's capacities for original ideas and action: by cultural education is meant forms of education that enable them to engage positively with the growing complexity and diversity of social values and ways of life.</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? NA</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe (UK) International impact</p> <p>Number of participants NA</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended NA</p> <p>Sex of participants NA</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? All Our FUTures</p> <p>Arts participation All</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? NA</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? The authors argue that there are important relationships between creative and cultural education, and significant implications for methods of teaching and assessment, the balance of the school curriculum and for partnerships between schools and the wider world.</p>
--	---	--

APPENDIX 28

Robinson, Ken, *Culture, Creativity and the Young: developing public policy*, Strasbourg, 1999.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? For all national governments there are two related priorities in planning for the future. The first is to find ways of realising the creative resources of all young people to enable them to participate in these changes positively and constructively. The second is to engage with cultural diversity while maintaining cultural identity and social cohesion.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation?</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? The future of Europe is its young people: their ambitions, sensibilities and values are the major foundations on which European development will be built. Young people are living in a world of immense and increasing complexities. At every turn the landscape through which they are moving is changing faster than at any time in history. This is true economically, socially and culturally. These concerns underpin the work of the Council of Europe's project "Culture, Creativity and the Young".</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? NA</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants NA</p> <p>Age of participants All</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended All</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Culture Creativity and the Young Arts participation All</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? This policy note summarises some of the issues and proposals which have begun to emerge from the activities of the project to date. It draws from a survey of arts education in Europe published in the exploratory phase of the project (Robinson, 1997); from international colloquies organised by the project and from a series of thematic studies commissioned by the project's international advisory group. The note argues that it is essential for national governments to frame coherent policies and programmes to support the creative and cultural development of all young people, and it identifies the central questions and issues which will define these policies and the principles on which they might be based.</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention NA</p>
--	---	--

APPENDIX 29

Robinson, Ken, *Out of our Minds: learning to be creative*, Oxford, 2001.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/low

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? Enhanced Creativity in schools</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? NA</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? It is often said that education and training are the keys to the future. They are, but a key can be turned in two directions. Turn it one way and you lock resources away, even from those they belong to. Turn it the other way and you release resources and give people back to themselves. To realize our true creative potential—in our organizations, in our schools and in our communities—we need to think differently about ourselves and to act differently towards each other. We must learn to be creative.</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? NA</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants NA</p> <p>Age of participants NA</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended NA</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? Out of our Minds: learning to be creative</p> <p>Arts participation All</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Various</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? No</p>
--	---	--

APPENDIX 30

MacKenzie, P., 'School choice in an international context', *Journal of Research in International Education*, 9 (2), 3020, pp. 107-123.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/high

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? International schools and schools offering curricula and qualifications that are not those designed and delivered by the state are increasingly common in many countries. They offer parents an alternative to national schools and the normative education they deliver. It concludes that common motives exist and it proposes eight factors that appear to have near universal appeal.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? Aggregated responses</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? This article compares five research exercises conducted in Switzerland, Japan, Argentina, Israel and Singapore that attempted to understand what motivated parents to choose for their children schools that were outside the national mainstream.</p> <p>Which methods were used to collect the data? Questionnaires, semi-structured interviews, aggregated responses</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? International</p> <p>Number of participants Large scale international</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Schools</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Findings: This exercise started as an attempt to see if any broad patterns have emerged from five different but comparable research projects concerned with parents' choice of school in an international context. It is argued that such patterns have indeed emerged and that, where a comparison is possible, there is a good deal more agreement between these five samples than disagreement.</p> <p>Each exercise highlighted specific factors that were of considerable importance to parents but were largely peculiar to each context. Israeli parents' poor opinion of state education and Argentinian parents' wish for a bilingual (Spanish and English) education are examples. But beyond the parochial, these parents commonly shared a set of priorities which influenced their choice of school: an education wholly or largely in English, the opportunity for their children to meet and interact with people of other cultures, a curriculum that looked beyond the national, examinations and qualifications with international currency, and a school environment that would meet their child's social, emotional and educational needs.</p> <p>Across five different cultures and research projects a common set of priorities appear to influence parental school choice. MacKenzie (2010) includes in these criteria a school curriculum that looks "beyond national examinations and qualifications" and "a school environment that would meet their child's social, emotional and educational needs".</p>
--	---	--

APPENDIX 31

Boulton, P., Coldron, J., "Happiness' as a criterion of parents' choice of school', *Journal of Education Policy*, 6 (2), 1991, pp. 169-178.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/high

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? This paper takes as its starting point the results of a number of projects that investigated the criteria parents use when choosing schools.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation and its conclusions? In those studies it was found that the happiness of the child was a crucial consideration and that academic criteria were significantly minimized. One of the projects, that was conducted at Sheffield, set out to try to clarify what parents might mean by the vague criterion of 'happiness'. The results of this investigation show a complex set of reasons cited by parents for their decisions. A possible explanation for the relative importance of the criteria is proposed. The conclusion is drawn that schools and those concerned with the presentation of their practice to parents should not be exclusively preoccupied with the single criterion of academic standards. It is hoped that these conclusions offer some evidence to justify existing good practice in schools.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? UK</p> <p>Number of participants Large scale</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Schools</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? "Drama Improves Lisbon Key Competences in Education – DICE"</p> <p>Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? Various</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? NA</p>
---	--	---

APPENDIX 32

Cziboly, Adam (Ed.), *DICE – Drama Improves Lisbon Key Competences in Education*, 2010
DICE Consortium: www.dramanetwork.eu.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/high

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? In addition to other educational aims, this two-year project was a cross-cultural research study investigating the effects of educational theatre and drama on five of the eight “Lisbon Key Competences”.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation and its conclusions? Compared with peers who had not been participating in any educational theatre and drama programmes, the theatre and drama participants:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - are assessed more highly by their teachers in all aspects; - feel more confident in reading and understanding tasks; - are more likely to feel that they are creative: - like going to school more; - enjoy school activities more; - are more tolerant towards both minorities and foreigners; - show more interest in participating in public issues; - are more innovative and entrepreneurial; - spend more time in school, more time reading, doing housework, playing, talking, and spend more time with family members and taking care of younger brothers and sisters; - feel better at home. 	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Hungary, Netherlands, Poland, Romania, Slovenia, UK, Czech Republic, Norway, Palestine, Portugal, Serbia, Sweden</p> <p>Number of participants 5000</p> <p>Age of participants 13-16 years</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended Schools</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Does the activity/intervention have a formal name? No</p> <p>Arts participation Various</p> <p>What is/are the setting(s) of the activity/intervention? 3 groups: a) Research groups with ‘one-occasion’ theatre and drama, in which the effects of theatre and drama as a special few-hours-long occasion (e.g. Theatre in Education programme) have been measured; b. Research groups with ‘continuous, regular theatre and drama activities’, in which the effects of regular meetings in a 4-month-long period (e.g. youth groups preparing theatre performances) have been measured (a minimum was 10 occasions during the 4 months); c. Control groups for both research groups, in which there were no occurrences of theatre and drama activities in education.</p> <p>Duration of the activity/intervention Various</p> <p>Intensity of the activity/intervention NA</p> <p>What treatment/intervention did the control/comparison group receive? NA</p>
--	---	--

APPENDIX 33

Raveaud, M.; and Zanten, A., 'Choosing the local school: middle class parents' values and social and ethnic mix in London and Paris', *Journal of Education Policy*, 22(1), 2007, pp. 107-124.

Overall weight of evidence: Medium/high

<p>What are the broad aims of the study? This paper analyses a specific kind of choice, choice of the local school, by a specific middle class group, characterized by its high cultural capital, its 'caring' perspective and liberal political orientation, in two cosmopolitan, 'mixed' settings, London and Paris, with a focus on values and how ethical dilemmas raised by confrontation with the social and ethnic mix in schools are solved.</p> <p>What was the design of the evaluation? It draws upon a small-scale comparative study of urban middle class parents conducted in 2004–2005 at the Institut d'Etudes Politiques in Paris in collaboration with the London Institute of Education. Using the same open-ended schedule, 28 interviews were carried out in one London locality and 38 in a similar locality in the Parisian periphery (plus 12 others in a nearby private school).</p> <p>What learning outcomes does the study measure/report? Its main purpose was to use a cross-Channel comparison to test and enrich a comprehensive model of school choice that tries to take into account the complex interaction between policies, strategies, contexts, resources and values. Its main purpose was to use a cross-Channel comparison to test and enrich a comprehensive model of choice that tries to take into account the complex interaction between policies, strategies, contexts, resources and values.</p>	<p>In which country/countries was the study conducted? Europe</p> <p>Number of participants 28</p> <p>Age of participants Various</p> <p>Type of educational institution attended School</p> <p>Sex of participants Male and female</p>	<p>Results: The comparison of choice of the local school in London and Paris shows that although policy is different and differently perceived on the two sides of the Channel, its influence on the educational strategies of middle class parents is less important than that of values and the way values interact with contexts and resources. These intellectual, liberal, 'caring' parents broadly share a very similar view of what constitutes a good education, which involves intellectual development, academic results and a happy school experience at the individual level, as well as a concern for equality and integration at the collective level.</p> <p>Across the channel a common set of priorities appear to influence middle-class parental school choice. Raveaud and Zanten (2007) conclude that in London and Paris, middle-class school choice is based on the offering of an education that "involves intellectual development, academic results and a happy school experience".</p>
--	--	--

